Using Peer Praise Notes to Address Problem Behavior at Recess

13th International Conference on Positive Behavior Support
San Francisco, CA
Session H9
March 25, 2016

Elise Teerlink, Ed.S.
Paul Caldarella, Ph.D.
Brigham Young University

Geovanni Guzman, M.S.
Alex Judd, M.S.
Provo City School District
Overview

Benefits of Recess
Playground Concerns
SWPBS and Appropriate Recess Behavior
Peer Praise Notes (PPNs)
Study Purpose
Setting and Participants
Intervention
School Procedures
Measures
Analysis
Results/Discussion
Limitations
Conclusion
Pair Share:
Talk with a partner about the benefits of recess.
Cognitive Benefits of Recess

- Executive functioning
- Response accuracy
- Focus
- Memory
- Academics

(Hillman, Erickson, & Kramer, 2008)
Social-Emotional Benefits of Recess

Opportunities to:

• Work and play together
• Develop social and emotional maturity
• Practice sharing and resolving conflicts
• Develop healthy peer relationships

(Bleeker et al., 2012; Pellegrini & Bohn, 2005)
Pair Share:
Talk with a partner about what problems you have noticed during recess.
Recess Concerns

- Safety
- Supervision
- Structure
How can SWPBS impact recess behavior?
SWPBS and Appropriate Recess Behavior

- Define
- Teach
- Support
- Use data

(Lewis & Sugai, 1999).
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>School Wide Expectations for Non-Classroom Settings</th>
<th>Be Respectful</th>
<th>Be Responsible</th>
<th>Be Safe</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Halls</strong></td>
<td>• Quiet voice</td>
<td>• Keep walking and stay with the class</td>
<td>• Walk in straight lines on the right</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Keep hall clean</td>
<td></td>
<td>• Eyes and body forward</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Bathroom</strong></td>
<td>• Respect the privacy of others</td>
<td>• Leave it clean</td>
<td>• Hands, feet, and objects to self</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Quiet voice</td>
<td>• Go/ Flush/ Wash</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Playground</strong></td>
<td>• Follow directions the first time</td>
<td>• Return equipment</td>
<td>• One squirt, two towels</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Be kind and friendly</td>
<td>• Use equipment appropriately</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Lunchroom</strong></td>
<td>• Use a polite voice</td>
<td>• Play by the game rules</td>
<td>• Keep yourself and others safe while having fun</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Help others if necessary</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Leave quietly</td>
<td>• Clean up my area (table and floor)</td>
<td>• Sit, eat, clean up</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Assembly</strong></td>
<td>• Sitting on my pockets</td>
<td>• Raise my hand to gain speaker’s attention</td>
<td>• Hands, feet, and objects to self</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Pay attention</td>
<td></td>
<td>• Stay with class</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Show appreciation appropriately</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Computer Lab</strong></td>
<td>• Follow directions the first time</td>
<td>• Stay only in programs I am assigned to be in</td>
<td>• Line up to get my laptop in an orderly fashion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Keep hands on my own laptop</td>
<td>• Use programs only for the purpose assigned to me</td>
<td>• Walk holding laptop with both hands</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Office</strong></td>
<td>Wait your turn</td>
<td>• Stand or sit quietly</td>
<td>• Hands, feet, and objects to self</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Use quiet voice</td>
<td>• Sit on the chair properly</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Library</strong></td>
<td>• Use a quiet voice</td>
<td>• Handle books with care</td>
<td>• Walk</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Go to the end of the line when lining up</td>
<td>• Push chair in</td>
<td>• Push chair in</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Possible Classroom Expectations</strong></td>
<td>• Raise my hand to gain teacher’s attention</td>
<td>• Follow directions the first time</td>
<td>• Hands, feet, and objects to self</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Keep appropriate communication</td>
<td>• Stay on task and finish work</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Stay in my assigned area</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Why Written Praise?

Can Increase:

- Student participation  
  (Duchaine, Jolivete, & Fredrick, 2011)
- Desired academic/social behavior  
  (Thompson, Marchant, Anderson, Prater, & Gibb, 2012)
- On-task behavior  
  (Sutherland, Wehby, & Copeland, 2000)
- Self-regulated learning  
  (Chalk & Bizo, 2004).

Can Decrease:

- Social withdrawal  
  (Peterson Nelson, Caldarella, Young, & Webb, 2008)
- Disruptive behavior  
  (Wheatley et al., 2009)
- Tardiness  
  (Caldarella, Christensen, Young, & Densley, 2011)
- ODRs  
  (Nelson, Young, Young, & Cox 2009).
Why Peer Praise?

• Increase amount of praise given
• Give students responsibility
• Sustain more effectively than teacher praise
• Support student autonomy
• Communicate rules more effectively
• Build relationships
WHAT are Peer Praise Notes (PPNs)?

Recess Paw

Student: ___________________ Teacher: ____________

BE RESPONSIBLE
☐ Return equipment.
☐ Use equipment appropriately.
☐ Play by the game rules.

BE RESPECTFUL
☐ Follow directions the first time.
☐ Be kind and friendly.

BE SAFE
☐ Keep your self and others safe while having fun.

Praiser: ___________________ Date: ____________

White Copy: Student       Yellow Copy: Office       Pink Copy: Teacher
No published studies have shown effects of PPNs on the playground.
Study Purpose

• Are PPNs effective when issued during recess?

• Are PPNs perceived as socially valid?
Setting

• Title I elementary school
• 4\textsuperscript{th} year of implementing SWPBS
• 32.38% ODRs had been given on the playground during the previous year
Participants

Students Eligible for PPNs:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Enrollment</th>
<th>#</th>
<th>%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Whole School</td>
<td>462</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Minority</td>
<td>283</td>
<td>61</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Economic Disadvantage</td>
<td>385</td>
<td>83</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>English Language Learners</td>
<td>176</td>
<td>38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Students with Disabilities</td>
<td>148</td>
<td>32</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Peer Praisers:

Upper grade students
- 70 fourth graders
- 61 fifth graders
- 36 sixth graders

Social Validity Surveys:

- 7 recess aides
- 1 administrator
- 88 randomly selected students (grades 1-6)
Intervention

PPNs distributed during lunch recess

White-Student

**Recess Paw**

Student: Teacher: ______

BE RESPONSIBLE
☐ Return equipment.
☐ Use equipment appropriately.
☐ Play by the game rules.

BE RESPECTFUL
☐ Follow directions the first time.
☐ Be kind and friendly.

BE SAFE
☐ Keep your self and others safe while having fun.

Praiser: Date:

White Copy: Student  Yellow Copy: Office  Pink Copy: Teacher

Pink- Teacher

Yellow - Office
Every 3 weeks....

School Procedures: Selection of Peer Praisers
School Procedures: Peer Praiser Training

- Peer praisers/parents were invited
- Playground rules
- Peer praiser responsibilities
- Procedures for issuing a PPN
- Practice
- Pizza
## School Procedures
### Distribution Goals

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Time</th>
<th>5th &amp; 6th</th>
<th>4th</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>12:20-12:25</td>
<td>2nd 2 paws</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12:25-12:30</td>
<td>1st 2 paws</td>
<td>12:30-12:45 Personal Lunch</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12:30-12:35</td>
<td>3rd 2 paws</td>
<td>12:45-12:50 5th 2 paws</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12:35-12:50</td>
<td>Personal Lunch</td>
<td>12:50-12:55 6th 2 paws</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>12:55-1:00 4th 2 paws</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
School Procedures: PPN Process

• Peer praiser pick up PPN bag from office
• Ask student’s name
• Tell student what rule they were keeping
• Put a check mark in the rule box on the PPN
• Write date and name of student’s teacher
• Give white copy to student, put yellow and pink copies on back of clipboard
• Put clipboards in the office
School Procedures: Mystery Motivator (Given on Fridays after lunch)

- Wii Game Time
- Pizza Party
- $5 Bill
- Field Trip
- Gift Certificate
- Lunch with the Principal
- Prize Drawing
Measures

Independent Variable:
- Average PPNs /day by week
- Treatment Integrity
- Tracked in FileMaker

Dependent Variable:
- Average ODRs / day by week
- Tracked in SWIS

Additional Measure:
- Social Validity Surveys
Office Discipline Referral Form

Name: _____________________________ Grade: _____ Date: __________

Referring Staff: ___________________ Time of incident: __________

Others involved: □ No One □ Peers □ Teacher □ Staff □ Substitute □ Unknown

Check 1-2 behaviors as applicable. Circle the primary behavior.

Major Problem Behavior: □ Defiance/Disrespect □ Physical Aggression □ Disruption □ Abusive Language □ Tardy □ Harassment □ Fighting □ Electronic Violation □ Dress Code 

Location: □ Classrooms □ Hall □ Playground □ Cafeteria □ Bathroom □ Bus Loading Zone □ Commons □ Don’t know Other:

Perceived Motivation □ Attention from peers □ Attention from adults □ Obtain item/activity □ Avoid peers □ Avoid adults □ Avoid work/activity □ Don’t know Other:

*Please avoid using “don’t know” or “other” whenever possible. Thanks. ~PBIS Team

Action(s) Taken:
□ Time Out/Detention □ Conference w/ student □ In-School Susp. _____ days

Loss of Privilege(s): □ Out-of-School Susp. _____ days

□ Parent Contact □ Other:

What happened?

____________________________________________________________

____________________________________________________________
Baseline: Aug. 21 - Oct. 24

PPN intervention: October 24 – Feb. 1

Reversal: Feb. 2 – Feb. 28

PPN intervention reinstated: Mar. 1- May 28

Design: ABAB reversal
Analysis

Effectiveness of PPNs
• Visual Analysis (level, trend, variability)
• Percent exceeding the median (PEM)

Social Validity Survey
• Quantitative - % who agreed or strongly agreed
• Qualitative - independent/collaborative analysis by two researchers (grouping comments into themes)

Treatment Integrity – Permanent Products
• Expected vs. Actual # of PPNs distributed
• Expected vs. Actual distributions across grade levels
Results: Effectiveness of PPNs
Results: Level, Trend, Variability, and PEM

- Downward trend and high variability in baseline phase and high variability in first intervention phase
- Changes in level, trend, and variability from reversal to reinstatement of intervention suggested a functional relationship between PPNs and reduction in ODRs
- PEM = 76.9% (1st intervention phase) - moderately effective
- PEM = 100% (2nd intervention phase) - highly effective
## Social Validity Survey Results

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Survey Items</th>
<th>% of Aides (n=8)</th>
<th>% of Students (n=88)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Students should get puma paws for doing good things at recess</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>93.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Puma Paws are an important way of communicating playground rules.</td>
<td>71.4</td>
<td>72.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Playground puma paws should continue to be used next year.</td>
<td>37.5</td>
<td>70.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Playground puma paws help with behavior in the classroom.</td>
<td>12.5</td>
<td>--</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I try to get playground puma paws at recess.</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>73.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Puma Paws help me talk to my parent(s) about friends</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>48.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Survey Items</td>
<td>% of Aides (n=8)</td>
<td>% of Students (n=88)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>------------------</td>
<td>----------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>It is important to know the playground rules.</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>94.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Playground puma paws take too much time.</td>
<td>62.5</td>
<td>--</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Students like to give playground puma paws.</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>--</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I would like to be a puma (peer praiser).</td>
<td>54.3*</td>
<td>--</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I got enough playground puma paws this year.</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>38.65</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>It is important to know the playground rules.</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>94.9</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Social Validity Results continued

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Survey Items</th>
<th>% of Aides (n=8)</th>
<th>% of Students (n=88)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Students like receiving playground puma paws.</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>84.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I enjoy bringing puma paws home to my parent(s).</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>76.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Parents like it when their child receives a playground puma paw.</td>
<td>75</td>
<td>--</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Peer relations are improved by playground puma paws.</td>
<td>42.9</td>
<td>62.45</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Student Response Themes
“What did you LIKE about PPNs?”

Rewards and Reinforcement (42.2%)
• “You sometimes get prizes.”
• “Every Puma Paw I get, my mom owes me a dollar.”

Better Behavior (20.5%)
• “It helps me behave.”
• They help students be nice and follow the rules.”
Student Response Themes
“What do you DISLIKE about PPNs?”

Not everyone receives what they deserve (50%)
• “They sometimes don’t give them to people who deserve them.”
• “I dislike when you do something good and they don’t give you a Puma Paw.”

It’s hard to get a PPN (25%)
• “It’s hard to get them.”
• « I don’t get enough.”
Recess Aide Response Themes
“What do you LIKE about PPNs?”

Positive influence among peers (44.5%)
• “PPNs build trusting relationships between peers”
• “They increase peer pressure in a positive way.”

PPNs give students a responsibility (33.3%)
• “PPNs extend the expectations to the school body.”
• “It gives kids some responsibility because they have something they need to get done.”

Students like them (22.2%)
• “Students are excited to have a turn handing them out”
• “The students light up when they get one.”
Recess Aide Response Themes
“What do you DISLIKE about PPNs?

Three weeks too long to be a praiser (46.2%)
• “After the first week of handing them out, the praisers were tired.”

Quick relief from responsibilities (30.8%)
• “Kids were trying to hurry and pass out Pumas so they could be done”

Giving PPNs to friends/younger kids who hadn’t earned them (23.1%)
• “Some students gave to their friends even if they weren’t following the playground rules.”
Percent of Expected PPNs Distributed
Distribution of PPNs Across Grade Levels

- 1st Grade, 21.74%
- 2nd Grade, 15.73%
- 3rd Grade, 10.77%
- 4th Grade, 28.83%
- 5th Grade, 15.39%
- 6th Grade, 7.55%
Limitations and Future Research

- Only studied at one school for one year
- Only upper grade students were peer praisers
- No direct observations
- Recess aides did not take an active role in the PPN intervention
- PPNs implemented only during lunch recess
- Issuing 6 PPNs during 12 minute recess was unrealistic
Conclusion

PPNs appeared to be an effective and acceptable intervention

- Improved student behavior
- Increased positive peer interactions
- Helped communicate playground rules
- Extended supervision responsibilities to students
- Offered a structured activity to peer praisers
- Relatively simple practice
- Support students in positive playground experiences that ultimately influence academic and social success

Results were promising

- Further research on PPNs is needed
References


Thank you!

For more information contact;

Elise Teerlink: eteerlink@alpinedistrict.org
Paul Caldarella: paul_caldarella@byu.edu
Geovanni Guzman: geog@provo.edu
Alex Judd: alexj@provo.edu